



New York State
Department of Economic Development
Division of Minority and Women's
Business Development

In the matter of the appeal of

Crane Industry Services, LLC

FINAL ORDER 19-17

From a denial of certification as a Women-owned Business Enterprise pursuant to Executive Law Article 15-A.

This order arises from an administrative appeal brought on behalf of Crane Industry Services, LLC (“Crane Industry”) pursuant to section 144.2 of title 5 of the New York Codes, Rules and Regulations. Appellant seeks reversal of the decision of the Division of Minority and Women’s Business Development (the “Division”), dated February 8, 2017, to deny Crane Industry certification as a Woman-owned Business Enterprise (“WBE”).

Appellant initiated this written appeal on March 17, 2017 and submitted its pleading on June 7, 2017. The Division, through counsel, Donald J. Tobias, Esq., responded to appellant’s appeal on July 16, 2019. Subsequent to that date, this appeal was then assigned to Administrative Law Judge P. Nicholas Garlick for review and drafting of a Recommended Order.

The single issue on appeal was whether Crane Industry demonstrated that Ms. Deborah Dickinson, as the woman owner relied upon for certification, made capital contributions in the form of money, property, equipment, or expertise in proportion to her equity interest in the business enterprise, as required by 5 NYCRR § 144.2(a)(1).

On August 19, 2019, the Division received a Recommended Order from Administrative Law Judge Garlick that recommended affirmation of the Division’s denial of the application to certify Crane Industry as a WBE on the ground set forth in the Division’s February 8, 2017 denial letter.

After considering the appeal record, I accept the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge as it pertains to the facts of this case. Incorporation by reference is hereby made with respect to the findings and conclusions of the Recommended Order.

It is hereby **ORDERED** that the decision to deny certification, dated February 8, 2017, is affirmed. Accordingly, Crane Industry Services, LLC will not be listed in the Division's directory for Minority and Women-owned Business Enterprises.

September 12, 2019



Valerie White
Executive Director
Division of Minority and Women's
Business Development