



New York State
Department of Economic Development
Division of Minority and Women's
Business Development

In the matter of the appeal of

Puppa Group, LLC

FINAL ORDER 17-52

From a denial of certification as a Women-owned Business Enterprise pursuant to Executive Law Article 15-A.

This order arises from an administrative appeal brought on behalf of Puppa Group, LLC ("Puppa Group") pursuant to section 144.4 of title 5 of the New York Codes, Rules and Regulations. Appellant seeks reversal of the decision of the Division of Minority and Women's Business Development (the "Division"), dated July 01, 2016, to deny Puppa Group certification as a Women-owned Business Enterprise ("WBE").

This appeal was assigned to Administrative Law Judge P. Nicholas Garlick. Ms. Christina Masi submitted a written appeal on behalf of Appellant on October 14, 2016. Mr. Phillip Harmonick, Esq. submitted a response to the appeal on August 07, 2017. The submissions of the parties are contained in the appeal record.


The issues on appeal were whether the woman owner of Puppa Group: contributed money, property, equipment, or expertise proportionate to her equity interest in Puppa Group; made decisions pertaining to the operations of the business enterprise; possessed adequate managerial experience or technical competence to operate the business enterprise; and devoted time on an ongoing basis to the daily operation of the business enterprise

On August 31, 2017, the Division received from Administrative Law Judge Garlick a Recommended Order that recommended affirmation of the Division's denial of the application to certify Puppa Group as a WBE on the grounds set forth in the Division's July 01, 2016 letter.

After considering the appeal record, I accept the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge as it pertains to the facts of this case. Incorporation by reference is hereby made with respect to the findings and conclusions of the Recommended Order.

It is hereby **ORDERED** that the decision to deny certification, dated July 01, 2016, is affirmed. Accordingly, Puppa Group will not be listed in the Division's directory of certified Minority and Women-owned Business Enterprises.

September 11, 2017



Lourdes Zapata
Executive Director
Division of Minority and Women's
Business Development