



**Division of Minority  
and Women's  
Business Development**

New York State  
Department of Economic Development  
Division of Minority and Women's  
Business Development

---

In the matter of the appeal of

**Quality Industries, Inc.**

FINAL ORDER 19-15

From a denial of certification as a Women-owned Business Enterprise pursuant to Executive Law Article 15-A.

---

This order arises from an administrative appeal brought on behalf of Quality Industries, Inc. ("Quality Industries") pursuant to section 144.2 of title 5 of the New York Codes, Rules and Regulations. Appellant seeks reversal of the decision of the Division of Minority and Women's Business Development (the "Division"), dated January 11, 2017, to deny Quality Industries certification as a Woman-owned Business Enterprise ("WBE").

Appellant initiated this written appeal on January 23, 2017 and submitted its pleading on April 24, 2017. The Division, through counsel, Benson V. Martin, Esq., responded to appellant's appeal on May 20, 2019. Subsequent to that date, this appeal was then assigned to Administrative Law Judge Helene Goldberger for review and drafting of a Recommended Order.

The single issue on appeal was whether Quality Industries demonstrated that the woman owner, Ms. Renee Raboy, shares in the risks and profits in proportion to her ownership interest in the business enterprise, as required by 5 NYCRR § 144.2(c)(2).

On June 4, 2019, the Division received a Recommended Order from Administrative Law Judge Goldberger that recommended affirmation of the Division's denial of the application to certify Quality Industries as a WBE on the ground set forth in the Division's January 11, 2017 denial letter.

After considering the appeal record, I accept the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge as it pertains to the facts of this case. Incorporation by reference is hereby made with respect to the findings and conclusions of the Recommended Order.

It is hereby **ORDERED** that the decision to deny certification, dated January 11, 2017, is affirmed. Accordingly, Quality Industries will not be listed in the Division's directory for Minority and Women-owned Business Enterprises.

August 2, 2019



---

Valerie White  
Executive Director  
Division of Minority and Women's  
Business Development