



THE CAREGIVING INDUSTRY IN NEW YORK STATE



**Empire State
Development**

I. Introduction

Hope Knight, President, CEO and Commissioner of Empire State Development (ESD), respectfully submits this report, prepared in consultation with the New York State Department of Health, the New York State Department of Labor and the New York State Office of Children and Family Services, on the findings of ESD's research pursuant to Chapter 744 of the Laws of 2021, concerning the "caregiving industry" in New York State. For the purposes of this report as defined in that Chapter, "caregiving industry" comprises direct care, home care, child care, adult care, private and non-profit nursing homes and residential facilities and, to the extent practicable, other entities that support formal and informal caregiving in New York State. The operational definitions of "the caregiving industry" used in this report are described in Section III, below.

In the main, this report reflects analysis by ESD and New York State agency partners of the outlook for:

- Growth of "caregiving industry" businesses and non-profits;
- Workforce development, recruitment, and retention in the "caregiving industry."

II. Empire State Development, the New York State Departments of Health and Labor, and the New York State Office of Children and Family Services

Empire State Development serves to promote a vigorous and growing state economy, encourage business investment and job creation, and support diverse, prosperous local economies across New York State through the efficient use of loans, grants, tax credits, real estate development, marketing, and other forms of assistance. To achieve this goal, ESD invests strategically in infrastructure, innovation, place-making and revitalization, tradable sectors and workforce development; is transparent and responsive to the needs of diverse communities across the state through the active participation of the Regional Councils; supports the retention and health of existing businesses, the retention of populations, and the development of new businesses and industries that will contribute to the development of the 21st century economy. ESD is the primary agency that promotes equality of economic opportunities for minority- and women-owned businesses as defined in New York State Law.¹

¹ More information about Empire State Development programs and activities is available at <https://esd.ny.gov/>

The New York State Department of Health's (DOH) mission is to ensure that high quality health services are available to all New Yorkers. Consistent with this mission, DOH manages comprehensive healthcare and long-term care coverage for low- and middle-income individuals and families through Medicaid, Child Health Plus, and the Essential Plan. Combined, these programs provide affordable health insurance coverage for nearly 9 million New Yorkers. At the forefront of the State's response to the COVID-19 pandemic, DOH also protects public health, funds and supervises community public health activities and critical social supports, regulates healthcare facilities statewide, and operates healthcare facilities including Helen Hayes Hospital, four nursing homes specifically for veterans' and their families, and the Wadsworth Center for Laboratories and Research, one of the premier public health research labs in the nation.²

The Department of Labor (NYSDOL), in turn, protects workers, operates the State's Unemployment Insurance System, and promotes workforce development. DOL's network of Career Centers provide job search and training support for employers and workers throughout the state, and a host of information and services are available online to further support career advancement and economic growth in New York. DOL serves as the critical generator and clearinghouse for information on labor force and occupational trends in New York, and also hosts the New York State Data Center.³

The New York State Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) oversees programs that support and provide child support enforcement; child care subsidies to assist low-income working families; protective services for children and adults; and services for at risk youth in communities, local detention centers, and State operated facilities.⁴

² For more on the New York State Department of Health see <https://www.health.ny.gov/>

³ Agency and program information about the New York State Department of Labor is available at <https://dol.ny.gov/>

⁴ For more information about the New York State Office of Children and Family Services go to <https://ocfs.ny.gov/main/>

III. Contours and Outlook for New York’s “Caregiving Industry”

New York has been a leader in advancing policies that address social determinants of health, including the conditions in which people are born, grow, work, live, play, and age, as well as the wider set of forces and systems shaping the conditions of daily life, all of which have a tremendous impact on the health and well-being of all people. The Governor and State Legislature have sought to ensure New York provides an environment where all New Yorkers can live and age with dignity and independence, aided through policies like the New York State Prevention Agenda, Health Across All Policies, Age-Friendly New York, the Age-Friendly Health System Initiative, and the New York State Plan on Aging.

According to a 2023 study by Center for an Urban Future, New York is home to more residents ages 65 and above—nearly 3.5 million—than the entire population of 21 states. Older adults are also driving most of the state’s population growth. Over the past decade, from 2011 to 2021, the number of New Yorkers ages 65 and over grew by an incredible 31 percent—an increase of 815,166 older adults. Today, nearly one in five New Yorkers is 65 and above (18 percent), a larger share of the state’s population than ever before.⁵

As noted in that study, the boom in the over-65 population is accelerating in cities and counties all over the state, with the fastest increases over the past decade occurring in Rochester (+64 percent), Saratoga County (+50 percent), Syracuse (+43 percent), Queens County (+39 percent), Dutchess County (+37 percent), New York City (+36 percent), and Orange County (+36 percent). In fact, the growth of New York’s older adult population is outpacing overall population growth in every one of the state’s 19 largest counties and most of its largest cities, including Rochester, Syracuse, Yonkers, Albany, and New York City.

According to DOH and State Office for the Aging, New York has the fourth-largest population of older adults in the U.S., with 3.2 million New Yorkers (16 percent of the population) over 65. New York’s population of those over the age of 60 is projected to grow to 5.3 million by 2030 with those over eighty years of age exceeding 1.2 million; By 2030, it is projected that 25 percent of the population in more than 51 counties will be 60 and older with at least 30 percent of the population in 18 counties 60 or older. The older adult population is growing faster than any other age group in the state. Older adults and baby boomers generate 63 percent of the household income in the State, supporting the economy and the tax base.⁶

⁵ See Center for an Urban Future, online at <https://nycfuture.org/research/keeping-pace-with-an-aging-new-york-state>

⁶ From New York State Office for the Aging, online at <https://aging.ny.gov/news/older-adults-economic-powerhouse#:~:text=Older%20adults%20also%20bring%20enormous,older%20adults%20and%20baby%20boomers.>

An aging population also indicates likelihood for an increase in health care utilization and health-related conditions, including chronic diseases. As reported by the New York State Division of the Budget, New York’s aging population is driving significant growth in the Medicaid program, as costs for those who need long term care are ten times that of a typical Medicaid enrollee.⁷

Care for the youngest New Yorkers is likewise essential. Affordable and accessible child care is one of the most important issues impacting New York’s families, communities, and workforce today. Affordable, high-quality child care is a lifeline that enables the parents of young children to enter and succeed in the workforce; employers to find and retain skilled workers; children to thrive; and many women-owned small businesses to get their start and grow as employers. The COVID-19 pandemic demonstrated the fragility of the system and how foundational child care is to work-life balance and a growing, inclusive economy.

Together, these trends have a bearing on the composition and outlook for caregiving industries in New York State.

Industry Composition

For the purposes of this requested study, ESD research staff have defined New York’s “caregiving industry” in accord with the 2017 edition of the North American Industry Classification System (NAICS), which was developed under the auspices of the U.S. Office of Management and Budget and in concert with Canadian and Mexican governmental authorities to establish a standardized protocol to categorize and account for entities based on the nature of goods or services produced. NAICS divides the economy into 20 sectors, at the two-digit level, and subdivides those 20 sectors into subgroupings of economic activity with increasing specificity up to the six-digit level.⁸ Twelve subgroupings were selected as comprising “the caregiving industry” for this study, which are collected in Table 1 and described according to NAICS in the paragraphs that follow.⁹

⁷ See FY2024 Budget Briefing Book, p. 76. Online at <https://www.budget.ny.gov/pubs/archive/fy24/ex/book/briefingbook.pdf>

⁸ For more on the North American Industry Classification System, see <https://www.census.gov/naics/?99967>

⁹ These descriptions are drawn directly from the North American Industry Classification System 2017 Manual, US Office of Management and Budget, available online at https://www.census.gov/naics/reference_files_tools/2017_NAICS_Manual.pdf

Table 1: Caregiving Industry Composition in New York			
NAICS Definition		Industry Employment 2021	
Code	Industry Description	#	%
621610	Home Health Care Services	299,111	32.0%
622310	Specialty (except Psychiatric and Substance Abuse) Hospitals	21,133	2.3%
623110	Nursing Care Facilities (Skilled Nursing Facilities)	103,397	11.1%
623210	Residential Intellectual and Developmental Disability Facilities	57,942	6.2%
623220	Residential Mental Health and Substance Abuse Facilities	20,085	2.2%
623311	Continuing Care Retirement Communities	10,012	1.1%
623312	Assisted Living Facilities for the Elderly	19,851	2.1%
623990	Other Residential Care Facilities	13,348	1.4%
624110	Child and Youth Services	21,771	2.3%
624120	Services for the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities	193,188	20.7%
624190	Other Individual and Family Services	57,327	6.1%
624410	Child Day Care Services	116,349	12.5%
Caregiving Total		933,515	100.0%

Source: Empire State Development Research; data from Lightcast, for All Types of Employees

621610 Home Health Care Services. This industry, with 32 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments primarily engaged in providing skilled nursing services in the home, along with a range of the following: personal care services; homemaker and companion services; physical therapy; medical social services; medications; medical equipment and supplies; counseling; 24-hour home care; occupation and vocational therapy; dietary and nutritional services; speech therapy; audiology; and high-tech care, such as intravenous therapy.

622310 Specialty (except Psychiatric and Substance Abuse) Hospitals. This industry, with 2.3 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments known and licensed as specialty hospitals primarily engaged in providing diagnostic and medical treatment to inpatients with a specific type of disease or medical condition (except psychiatric or substance abuse). Hospitals providing long-term care for the chronically ill and hospitals providing rehabilitation, restorative, and adjustive services to physically challenged or disabled people are included in this industry. These establishments maintain inpatient beds and provide patients with food services that meet their nutritional requirements. They have an organized staff of physicians and other medical staff to provide patient care services. These hospitals may provide other services, such as outpatient services, diagnostic X-ray services, clinical laboratory services,

operating room services, physical therapy services, educational and vocational services, and psychological and social work services.

623110 Nursing Care Facilities (Skilled Nursing Facilities). This industry, with 11.1 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments primarily engaged in providing inpatient nursing and rehabilitative services. The care is generally provided for an extended period of time to individuals requiring nursing care. These establishments have a permanent core staff of registered or licensed practical nurses who, along with other staff, provide nursing and continuous personal care services.

623210 Residential Intellectual and Developmental Disability Facilities. This industry, with 6.2 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments (e.g., group homes, hospitals, intermediate care facilities) primarily engaged in providing residential care services for persons diagnosed with intellectual and developmental disabilities. These facilities may provide some health care, though the focus is room, board, protective supervision, and counseling.

623220 Residential Mental Health and Substance Abuse Facilities. This industry, with 2.2 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments primarily engaged in providing residential care and treatment for patients with mental health and substance abuse illnesses. These establishments provide room, board, supervision, and counseling services. Although medical services may be available at these establishments, they are incidental to the counseling, mental rehabilitation, and support services offered. These establishments generally provide a wide range of social services in addition to counseling.

623311 Continuing Care Retirement Communities. This industry, with 1.1 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments primarily engaged in providing a range of residential and personal care services with on-site nursing care facilities for (1) the elderly and other persons who are unable to fully care for themselves and/or (2) the elderly and other persons who do not desire to live independently. Individuals live in a variety of residential settings with meals, housekeeping, social, leisure, and other services available to assist residents in daily living. Assisted living facilities with on-site nursing care facilities are included in this industry.

623312 Assisted Living Facilities for the Elderly. This industry, with 2.1 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments primarily engaged in providing residential and personal care services (i.e., without on-site nursing care facilities) for (1) the elderly

or other persons who are unable to fully care for themselves and/or (2) the elderly or other persons who do not desire to live independently. The care typically includes room, board, supervision, and assistance in daily living, such as housekeeping services.

623990 Other Residential Care Facilities. This industry, with 1.4 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments primarily engaged in providing residential care (and not included in prior categories of residential care), such as group homes. These establishments also provide supervision and personal care services.

624110 Child and Youth Services. This industry, with 2.3 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments primarily engaged in providing nonresidential social assistance services for children and youth. These establishments provide for the welfare of children in such areas as adoption and foster care, drug prevention, life skills training, and positive social development.

624120 Services for the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities. This industry, with 20.7 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments primarily engaged in providing nonresidential social assistance services to improve the quality of life for the elderly, persons diagnosed with intellectual and developmental disabilities, or persons with disabilities. These establishments provide for the welfare of these individuals in such areas as day care, non-medical home care or homemaker services, social activities, group support, and companionship.

624190 Other Individual and Family Services. This industry, with 6.1 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments primarily engaged in providing nonresidential individual and family social assistance services (except those specifically directed toward children, the elderly, persons diagnosed with intellectual and developmental disabilities, or persons with disabilities).

624410 Child Day Care Services. This industry, with 12.5 percent of all “caregiving employment” as of 2021, comprises establishments primarily engaged in providing day care of infants or children. These establishments generally care for preschool children but may care for older children when they are not in school and may also offer pre-kindergarten and/or kindergarten educational programs.

The Trend in Caregiving Industry Employment

Using the above-referenced NAICS industry definitions, ESD examined the trend in employment for the caregiving industry in New York State drawing on labor market data from Lightcast.¹⁰ In the interest of including all industry workers, these data encompass all types of employees working among these industries in New York State, including those employed by firms and reported in the Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages, non-QCEW employees, self-employed individuals and extended proprietors. The levels and change in employment from 2011 to 2021 for the 12 listed industries is summarized in Table 2.

As shown in Table 2, levels and growth in employment among this collection of industries was highest for Home Health Services, where over 150,000 jobs were added from 2011-2021 for an increase of nearly 104 percent. Employment levels and growth in jobs was also high in Services for the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities, where job gains topped 58,000 employees for an increase in jobs of more than 43 percent.

Table 2: Caregiving Industry Employment in New York State 2011-2021

NAICS Code	Industry Description	Number of Industry Employees in New York State, All Types											Change 2011-2019	Change 2019-2021	Change 2011-2021	Ave Annual 2011-2019	Ave Annual 2019-2021
		2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021					
621610	Home Health Care Services	146,774	150,485	166,796	179,654	193,805	207,746	228,403	257,846	289,166	288,585	299,111	97.0%	3.4%	103.8%	12.1%	1.7%
622310	Specialty (except Psychiatric and Substance Abuse) Hospitals	15,473	16,295	17,006	17,335	17,820	18,175	19,179	19,773	20,273	21,242	21,133	31.0%	4.2%	36.6%	3.9%	2.1%
623110	Nursing Care Facilities (Skilled Nursing Facilities)	129,940	127,307	125,610	125,071	124,446	125,837	123,552	123,658	122,074	112,765	103,397	-6.1%	-15.3%	-20.4%	-0.8%	-7.6%
623210	Residential Intellectual and Developmental Disability Facilities	52,487	53,796	56,583	57,060	57,872	59,621	61,643	64,167	64,514	59,372	57,942	22.9%	-10.2%	10.4%	2.9%	-5.1%
623220	Residential Mental Health and Substance Abuse Facilities	18,975	19,306	18,736	18,611	18,403	18,402	19,007	19,690	20,602	20,236	20,085	8.6%	-2.5%	5.9%	1.1%	-1.3%
623311	Continuing Care Retirement Communities	5,944	5,976	6,998	8,076	8,209	8,605	8,795	9,376	10,168	10,069	10,012	71.1%	-1.5%	68.5%	8.9%	-0.8%
623312	Assisted Living Facilities for the Elderly	19,207	19,652	20,005	20,364	21,074	21,722	22,264	22,762	21,912	20,480	19,851	14.1%	-9.4%	3.4%	1.8%	-4.7%
623990	Other Residential Care Facilities	18,035	17,700	17,428	16,230	15,934	15,819	15,801	15,813	15,989	14,227	13,348	-11.3%	-16.5%	-26.0%	-1.4%	-8.3%
624110	Child and Youth Services	22,269	22,433	22,690	23,541	24,992	25,038	24,226	25,382	26,679	22,718	21,771	19.8%	-18.4%	-2.2%	2.5%	-9.2%
624120	Services for the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities	134,875	140,430	138,765	141,296	144,479	150,344	156,825	172,947	189,107	185,284	193,188	40.2%	2.2%	43.2%	5.0%	1.1%
624190	Other Individual and Family Services	49,712	48,005	48,376	50,609	51,010	53,698	56,857	58,984	60,364	57,249	57,327	21.4%	-5.0%	15.3%	2.7%	-2.5%
624410	Child Day Care Services	156,399	152,776	145,729	144,618	139,718	136,235	133,336	130,442	132,037	112,283	116,349	-15.6%	-11.9%	-25.6%	-1.9%	-5.9%
Caregiving Total		770,089	774,161	784,722	802,466	817,760	841,242	869,887	920,840	972,885	924,510	933,515	26.3%	-4.0%	21.2%	3.3%	-2.0%

Source: Empire State Development Research; data from Lightcast, for All Types of Employees

¹⁰ Formerly EMSI, a labor market analytics firm. For more see: <https://lightcast.io/about/data>

Table 2 also illustrates some of the impact COVID-19 had on levels of employment among these industries in New York State. In starkest contrast, strong increases in employment over the pre-COVID-19 period of 2011-2019 reversed to declines in employment over 2019-2021: for employment at Continuing Care Retirement Communities, where employment increased by over 71 percent 2011-2019 (an average annual change of +8.9 percent) but fell 1.5 percent 2019-2021 (average annual change of -0.8 percent); in residential facilities for New Yorkers with Intellectual or Developmental Disabilities, where an employment increase of nearly 23 percent 2011-2019 (average annual change of +2.9 percent) turned to a decline of over 10 percent 2019-2021 (average annual change of -5.1 percent); at Child and Youth Services, where an increase of nearly 20 percent (average annual increase of +2.5 percent) from 2011-2019 became a decline of -18.4 percent from 2019-2021 (average annual change of -9.2 percent); and at Assisted Living Facilities for the Elderly, where an increase in employment levels of 14 percent 2011-2019 (annual average change of +1.8 percent) became a decline of over 9 percent 2019-2021 (average annual change of -4.7 percent).

Other industry groups saw a much larger increase in employment before COVID-19 than after, including at Home Health Care Services, where employment increased 97 percent or an average annual change of +12.1 percent 2011-2019 and by 3.4 percent 2019-2021 (annual average change of +1.7 percent); Specialty Hospitals, where employment rose by 31 percent 2011-2019 (average annual change of +3.9 percent) compared to 4 percent 2019-2021 (average annual change of +2.1 percent), and at Services for the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities, where employment rose over 40 percent 2011-2019 (average annual change of +5.0 percent) compared to 2.2 percent 2019-2021 (average annual change of +1.1 percent).

A third set of industry groups saw decreases in the number of jobs in the pre-COVID-19 period as well as from 2019-2021. For each of these industry groups, the average annual rate of decrease in employment for the two periods intensified. Employment at Child Day Care Services as reported by Lightcast fell by over 40,000 jobs from 2011-2021, or a decline in employment of 25.6 percent. This included a decrease in employment of 15.6 percent from 2011-2019 (average annual change of -1.9 percent) and a decrease of -11.9 percent 2019-2021 (average annual change of -5.9 percent). The number of jobs declined from 2011 to 2021 by a slightly larger proportion of -26 percent in the Other Residential Care Facilities industry, including a decrease of -11.3 percent from 2011-2019 (average annual change of -1.4 percent) and a decrease of -16.5 percent 2019-2021 (average annual change of -8.3 percent). Employment at Skilled Nursing Care Facilities fell by -20.4 percent 2011-2021, including a decrease of -6.1 percent 2011-2019 (average annual change of -0.8 percent) and a decrease of -15.3 percent 2019-2021 (average annual change of -7.6 percent).

All together, caregiving industry employment levels rose by 163,426 jobs from 2011 to 2021, for an increase in employment of 21.2 percent. This overall trend comprised two periods: one with an average annual increase in employment among caregiving industries of 3.3 percent from 2011-2019, followed by an average annual decline in employment of -2.0 percent 2019-2021.

Table 3 reports the trend in total industry wages paid for this same collection of twelve caregiving industry groups in New York State from 2011 to 2021.

Table 3: Total Wages Paid by Caregiving Industry in New York State 2011-2021									
NAICS Code	Industry Description	Total Industry Wages in New York State			Change 2011-2019	Change 2019-2021	Change 2011-2021	Ave Annual 2011-2019	Ave Annual 2019-2021
		2011	2019	2021					
621610	Home Health Care Services	\$3,956,697,654	\$8,612,231,304	\$9,450,896,439	117.7%	9.7%	138.9%	14.7%	4.9%
622310	Specialty (except Psychiatric and Substance Abuse) Hospitals	\$1,294,724,532	\$2,245,697,931	\$2,506,819,188	73.4%	11.6%	93.6%	9.2%	5.8%
623110	Nursing Care Facilities (Skilled Nursing Facilities)	\$4,830,678,822	\$5,376,154,464	\$5,199,909,856	11.3%	-3.3%	7.6%	1.4%	-1.6%
623210	Residential Intellectual and Developmental Disability Facilities	\$1,488,051,912	\$2,221,523,353	\$2,310,096,357	49.3%	4.0%	55.2%	6.2%	2.0%
623220	Residential Mental Health and Substance Abuse Facilities	\$598,983,997	\$824,060,293	\$877,891,820	37.6%	6.5%	46.6%	4.7%	3.3%
623311	Continuing Care Retirement Communities	\$161,980,203	\$344,317,550	\$373,301,407	112.6%	8.4%	130.5%	14.1%	4.2%
623312	Assisted Living Facilities for the Elderly	\$464,149,955	\$686,080,617	\$727,591,414	47.8%	6.1%	56.8%	6.0%	3.0%
623990	Other Residential Care Facilities	\$609,328,948	\$667,127,555	\$635,863,356	9.5%	-4.7%	4.4%	1.2%	-2.3%
624110	Child and Youth Services	\$607,678,250	\$858,180,693	\$845,063,368	41.2%	-1.5%	39.1%	5.2%	-0.8%
624120	Services for the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities	\$3,166,293,135	\$5,273,858,107	\$5,798,571,700	66.6%	9.9%	83.1%	8.3%	5.0%
624190	Other Individual and Family Services	\$1,535,963,215	\$2,329,352,161	\$2,542,757,576	51.7%	9.2%	65.5%	6.5%	4.6%
624410	Child Day Care Services	\$2,462,558,843	\$2,941,482,716	\$2,890,099,766	19.4%	-1.7%	17.4%	2.4%	-0.9%
	Caregiving Total	\$21,177,089,467	\$32,380,066,743	\$34,158,862,247	52.9%	5.5%	61.3%	6.6%	2.7%

Source: Empire State Development Research; data from Lightcast, for All Types of Employees. Wages in nominal dollars.

Nursing Care Facilities paid the most total wages among caregiving industries in 2011 but ranked third by 2021, eclipsed by larger growth over the same period in total wages paid to all types of employees in Home Health Care Services (an increase in total wages paid of +138.9 percent) and in Services for the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities (+83.1 percent). Other caregiving industries with notably high increases in total wages paid include Continuing Care Retirement Communities, with an increase in total wages paid of over 130 percent, and Specialty Hospitals, where total wages paid increased by almost 94 percent. By comparison, total wages paid were practically flat from 2011 to 2021 at Other Residential Care Facilities and Nursing Care Facilities, which increased by a total of 4.4 percent and 7.6 percent respectively. Total wages paid in Child Day Care Services increased by 17.4 percent from 2011 to 2021.

For the pre-COVID-19 period of 2011-2019, average annual increase in total wages paid was highest for Home Health Care and Continuing Care Retirement Communities, with annual increases in total wages paid averaging above 14 percent. The level of increase in total wages paid was smallest for Nursing Care Facilities and Other Residential Facilities, which averaged a little more than 1 percent annually. For the 2019-2021 period, however, average annual increases in total wages paid were highest for Specialty Hospitals and at Services for the Elderly and People with Disabilities, both at 5 percent or above annually. By contrast, total wages paid declined on an annual average basis at Other Residential Care Facilities (average annual change of -2.3 percent), Nursing Care Facilities (average annual change of -1.6 percent) and Child Day Care Services (average annual change of -0.9 percent).

Table 4 reports the average annual wages paid by each of the twelve caregiving industry groups from 2011 to 2021. As shown, average annual wages were highest in the Specialty Hospitals industry group for both 2011 and 2021; more than double the averages for Nursing Care Facilities, which had the next highest average in both years. The lowest annual average industry wage in both 2011 and 2021 belonged to the Child Day Care Services industry group. However, the largest increase in annual average wage from 2011 to 2021 also belonged to Child Day Care Services, at an increase of nearly 58 percent, followed by average annual wages at Assisted Living Facilities for the Elderly, where average annual wages increased by almost 52 percent. Growth in pay among “caregiving industries” was lowest in the Home Health Care Services industry group, where annual average wages grew by a little over 17 percent 2011-2021.

Table 4: Average Annual Wages by Caregiving Industry in New York State 2011-2021

NAICS Code	Industry Description	Average Annual Industry Wage											Change 2011-2019	Change 2019-2021	Change 2011-2021	Ave Annual 2011-2019	Ave Annual 2019-2021
		2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021					
621610	Home Health Care Services	\$26,958	\$26,620	\$26,379	\$26,608	\$26,436	\$26,295	\$26,849	\$28,351	\$29,783	\$31,609	\$31,597	10.5%	6.1%	17.2%	1.3%	3.0%
622310	Specialty (except Psychiatric and Substance Abuse) Hospitals	\$83,675	\$86,632	\$86,515	\$93,688	\$96,242	\$99,154	\$102,779	\$104,389	\$110,773	\$115,623	\$118,619	32.4%	7.1%	41.8%	4.0%	3.5%
623110	Nursing Care Facilities (Skilled Nursing Facilities)	\$37,176	\$36,597	\$37,357	\$37,952	\$38,912	\$39,551	\$40,731	\$42,189	\$44,040	\$47,637	\$50,291	18.5%	14.2%	35.3%	2.3%	7.1%
623210	Residential Intellectual and Developmental Disability Facilities	\$28,351	\$28,435	\$28,413	\$29,466	\$30,338	\$30,354	\$31,760	\$33,207	\$34,435	\$38,016	\$39,869	21.5%	15.8%	40.6%	2.7%	7.9%
623220	Residential Mental Health and Substance Abuse Facilities	\$31,568	\$32,364	\$32,337	\$33,465	\$34,618	\$35,152	\$36,935	\$38,524	\$39,999	\$42,864	\$43,709	26.7%	9.3%	38.5%	3.3%	4.6%
623311	Continuing Care Retirement Communities	\$27,253	\$26,341	\$27,784	\$29,033	\$30,128	\$30,535	\$31,123	\$32,351	\$33,863	\$37,528	\$37,285	24.3%	10.1%	36.8%	3.0%	5.1%
623312	Assisted Living Facilities for the Elderly	\$24,166	\$24,002	\$24,330	\$25,212	\$26,366	\$26,748	\$27,946	\$29,569	\$31,310	\$35,169	\$36,653	29.6%	17.1%	51.7%	3.7%	8.5%
623990	Other Residential Care Facilities	\$33,786	\$34,218	\$34,400	\$35,750	\$36,503	\$37,617	\$37,981	\$39,945	\$41,725	\$47,370	\$47,637	23.5%	14.2%	41.0%	2.9%	7.1%
624110	Child and Youth Services	\$27,288	\$28,013	\$28,090	\$28,637	\$28,762	\$28,696	\$30,536	\$31,471	\$32,167	\$36,499	\$38,817	17.9%	20.7%	42.2%	2.2%	10.3%
624120	Services for the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities	\$23,476	\$23,156	\$23,515	\$23,826	\$24,493	\$24,292	\$25,244	\$26,705	\$27,888	\$29,754	\$30,015	18.8%	7.6%	27.9%	2.3%	3.8%
624190	Other Individual and Family Services	\$30,897	\$31,843	\$32,928	\$33,277	\$34,619	\$35,181	\$35,654	\$37,055	\$38,588	\$42,842	\$44,355	24.9%	14.9%	43.6%	3.1%	7.5%
624410	Child Day Care Services	\$15,745	\$16,243	\$16,974	\$17,541	\$18,408	\$19,270	\$20,328	\$21,420	\$22,278	\$23,290	\$24,840	41.5%	11.5%	57.8%	5.2%	5.8%
Caregiving Total		\$27,500	\$27,586	\$28,067	\$28,717	\$29,414	\$29,745	\$30,726	\$32,020	\$33,283	\$35,972	\$36,592	21.0%	9.9%	33.1%	2.6%	5.0%

Source: Empire State Development Research; data from Lightcast, for All Types of Employees. Wages in nominal dollars.

For the 2011-2019 period (pre-COVID-19) the average annual change in the average annual wage paid by industry ranged from a high of +5.2 percent per year for Child Day Care Services and +4.0 percent at Specialty Hospitals, to lows of +1.3 percent on average per year for Home Health Care Service workers and +2.2 percent as the average annual increase in average wages for Child and Youth Services workers. For 2019-2021, the average annual change in the average wage for caregiving industry workers was nearly double the rate per year from 2011-2019, at +5.0 percent annually compared to +2.6 percent. The largest increase by far was for Child and Youth Services workers, at an average annual increase over 10 percent, and at Assisted Living Facilities for the Elderly, where workers saw average annual increases in average wages of +8.5 percent. Another four industry groups saw average annual increases above 7 percent in their annual average industry wage from 2019-2021. Home Health Care Services workers saw the smallest annual average increase in average wages paid, at +3.0 from 2019-2021.

Industry Employment Forecast

ESD Research built a statistical model to generate a forecast of New York State caregiving industry employment change, using NYSDOL long-term projections for Nursing and Residential Care Facilities and for Social Assistance subsectors as the driver. This model forecasts employment for the caregiving industry in New York to increase by 235,041 jobs (25.2 percent) between 2021 and 2030.

Impact Estimates

ESD Research utilized Lightcast's Input-Output Modelling Scenario tool to generate estimates of the New York State economic impact of the caregiving industry. This set of industries was found to have an employment multiplier of 1.4. This means that each additional job in New York's caregiving industry would be expected to generate another 0.4 jobs in the state economy. Employment multipliers in this range are typical among service industries providing services to local residents and not for export. By comparison, New York's Tech Sector—a key target of New York economic growth policy and strategy—has an estimated employment multiplier of 3.3; an added job in New York's Tech Cluster generates another 2.3 jobs added to the New York State economy.¹¹

ESD's Input-Output Modelling estimates that New York's caregiving industry has a Gross Regional Product (GRP) earnings multiplier of 1.6. GRP earnings refer to the income or earnings generated by the production of goods and services within a region. This can include income earned by individuals, businesses, and government entities within the region. Essentially, for each dollar spent in the

¹¹ Empire State Development's definition of New York's Tech Cluster is incorporated as an Appendix to this report.

caregiving industry, another 60 cents is generated in added GRP earnings in the state economy. New York’s Tech Cluster, by comparison, has an estimated GRP earnings multiplier of 2.1; one dollar spent in the Tech Cluster is estimated to generate another \$1.1 in added GRP earnings in the state economy.

ESD Research also reports that according to Lightcast Input-Output Modelling tool, estimated State Tax Revenue total impact from caregiving industries in New York was \$6,223,489,024 in 2021.

Occupational Composition of the Caregiving Industry

What are the main occupations of people employed by the caregiving industry in New York State? The New York State Department of Labor gathers and reports data on Occupational Employment by Industry, drawn from the Occupational Employment and Wages Survey (OEWS). OEWS results are gathered through a panel survey conducted twice annually, averaged over three years. The most recent results cover the period 2018-2021, updated for cost-of-living adjusted as of the first quarter of 2022. Results are reported at the specificity of 4-digit NAICS, translating to Industry Group, rather than 6-digit Industry-level definitions used in the preceding discussion above. The Industry groupings used to define the caregiving industry in New York for this section of this report are listed in Table 5.

Table 5: “Caregiving Industry” Groups, Occupational Staffing Patterns in New York

NAICS Code	Industry Description
6216	Home Health Care Services
6223	Specialty (except Psychiatric and Substance Abuse) Hospitals
6231	Nursing Care Facilities (Skilled Nursing Facilities)
6232	Residential Intellectual and Developmental Disability Facilities
6233	Continuing Care Retirement Communities and Assisted Living Facilities for the Elderly
6239	Other Residential Care Facilities
6241	Other Individual and Family Services, including Child and Youth Services, Services for the Elderly and Persons with Disabilities
6244	Child Day Care Services

According to the most recent NYSDOL Staffing Patterns data, a total of 832,970 jobs existed in New York among the eight industry groups listed in Table 5. Each job is further categorized according to its Standard Occupational Codes (SOC) which, like the classification of industry according to NAICS above, are established by the U.S. Office of Management and Budget to provide a systematic way to

classify all workers into major, minor and detailed occupational categories based on similar job duties, skills, education, and/or training.¹²

At the occupational group level, Healthcare Support has the largest share of occupational employment in New York's caregiving industry, representing nearly six-in-ten industry jobs as defined by this study. Within that category, Home Health and Personal Care Aides is by far the largest individual occupation at the detailed SOC level, comprising 54 percent of total "industry" occupational employment.

Healthcare Practitioners and Technical Occupations are a distant second in terms of largest share of industry occupational employment, representing about one-twelfth of total occupational employment in New York's caregiving industry. Registered Nurses [at 3.5 percent of total caregiving occupation jobs] and Licensed Practical and Licensed Vocational Nurses [at 2.2 percent of total caregiving occupation jobs] are significant members of this category.

Next are Community and Social Service Occupations at 6.5 percent of New York caregiving industry occupational employment. Healthcare Social Workers, other social workers, therapists and Social and Human Service Assistant occupations predominate in this category. The Education, Training and Library occupational group comprise about one-twentieth of the caregiving industry's occupational employment in New York State, primarily in the form of preschool, special education preschool and pre-k teachers and teaching assistants. Personal Care and Service occupations hold the next-largest share of industry occupational employment, including Childcare Workers at about 2.2 percent of the overall total, as well as recreation workers and residential assistants.

Business Office and Administrative Support Occupations and jobs in facility operations in support of care round out the balance of occupational employment among caregiving industries in New York. These include Office and Administrative Support Occupations, at 5.8 percent, Management Occupations at 2.8 percent, Food Preparation and service at 2.5 percent, Business and Financial occupations at 2 percent, and Building/Grounds maintenance occupations at 1.8 percent of caregiving industry occupational employment in New York State. Final categories include Transportation and Material Moving occupations; in this industry grouping, detailed occupations primarily involve drivers of shuttles transporting those served to care provided.

¹² An explanation of Standard Occupational Code classification is available from the US Bureau of Labor Statistics, online at <https://www.bls.gov/soc/socguide.htm>

A summary is shown in Table 6.

Table 6: Share of Occupational Employment in New York’s “Caregiving Industry”	
Standard Occupational Group	Percentage of “Caregiving Industry” Occupational Employment
Healthcare Support	59.0
Healthcare Practitioners and Technical	8.4
Community and Social Service	6.5
Office and Administrative Support	5.8
Education, Training, and Library	5.1
Personal Care and Service	3.9
Management	2.8
Food Preparation and Serving Related	2.5
Business and Financial Operations; Computer	2.2
Building and Grounds Cleaning and Maintenance	1.8
Installation, Maintenance, and Repair	0.9
Transportation and Material Moving	0.3
Total	100.0

Source: Staffing Patterns for Select NAICS, from New York State Department of Labor, drawn from Occupational Employment and Wages Survey 2018-2021.

Projected Occupational Employment in New York’s Caregiving Industry

Occupational estimates and projections for New York State are developed every other year by the New York State Department of Labor. The most recent covers the period 2020-2030.¹³ For each identified occupation classified by SOC, the State Labor Department projects: occupational employment levels; average annual future job openings; average, entry and experienced wage levels,

¹³ Projections involve industry employment totals for the base year and industry employment estimates projected for 2030, which are a function of several factors including national and local area trends in industry employment, population, personal income and the statewide economic outlook. NYSDOL applies occupational staffing patterns from the OEWS survey to the industry employment totals to produce base year occupational employment estimates. In turn, expected staffing pattern changes are applied to the base year pattern. The modified staffing patterns are then applied to projected industry employment levels to obtain projected occupational employment levels, with added consideration for replacement rates, growth, separations from the labor force or other changes.

corresponding to the bottom-third and the top-two thirds of the distribution of wages paid in the occupation, respectively; formal educational requirements and prior work history in the field for entry to the occupation.

We used NYSDOL employment projections for the 2020-2030 period to examine results for 62 detailed occupations in New York; those that emerged from our analysis of Staffing Patterns data as comprising the larger shares of total occupational employment among the caregiving industry in New York State. Summary results may be found in Appendix A to this report, where individual occupations are grouped according to major SOC categories and in order of largest to smallest share of caregiving industry occupational employment.¹⁴

Healthcare Support Occupations are projected to remain among the largest major groups of occupations in New York's caregiving industry in 2030. Representing more than twice the number of jobs as the next-largest major category in both 2020 and 2030, Healthcare Support Occupations are projected to grow by 35.4 percent, with nearly 114,000 job openings each year on average. Home Health and Personal Care Aides and Nursing Assistants, as individual occupations, comprise by far the largest share of this major group.

Healthcare Professional and Technical Occupations represent New York's fourth-largest major grouping of caregiving occupational jobs in 2020 and 2030, with Registered and Licensed Nurses as the largest individual occupations in the category. The projected job growth is second-lowest of the 12 major groups analyzed, however, with projected average annual job openings at less than one-quarter the pace expected for Healthcare Support Occupations.

Community and Social Service Occupations are second-smallest among the major categories for projected number of jobs. Employment is projected to increase by 29.2 percent from 2020-2030, with average annual job openings projected to be a little above 18,000.

Office and Administrative Support Occupations are the largest group in number of jobs in 2020 and projected to remain so in 2030. Although it is projected to generate more than 104,000 annual job openings on average, at 9.5 percent, it is projected to have the lowest percentage increase in jobs among the 12 major groups.

¹⁴ NYSDOL appropriately cautions that these 10-year projections are approximations of a possible future based on past trends, subject to limitations from survey sample size, extraneous events affecting the economy, and technological change affecting the mix of service methodologies, among other factors. But they provide an informed estimation useful to understanding projected size and shape of caregiving industry employment in New York through 2030.

Education, Training and Library Occupations rank seventh among the 12 major occupational groups. Including Teaching Assistants as well as preschool and enrichment teachers among New York's caregiving occupations, jobs in the group are projected to increase in number by 27.5 percent 2020-2030 with average annual openings north of 28,000 jobs.

Personal Care and Service Occupations are to be found next, ranked 9th in relative size of job increase among the 12 major occupational groups. Including Childcare, the number of jobs is projected to increase by over 29 percent 2020-2030 with more than 25,000 job openings on average per year.

Management Occupations are projected to have the sixth-largest increase in jobs among the 12 major groups. General and Operations Managers are the most prominent detailed occupations in the category, with Medical and Health Managers and Social and Community Service Managers as sizeable contributors. The number of jobs in the group as a whole is projected to increase by 31.6 percent with average annual openings of more than 26,000 jobs.

Caregiving industries frequently involve facility operations. Jobs in the Food Preparation and Serving Related occupational group are projected to increase by 62.5 percent from 2020-2030, with average annual job openings projected to be above 37,000. Business and Financial Operations and Computer Operations together rank third-largest in number of jobs, projected to increase by 18.2 percent with over 36,000 annual job openings on average. Buildings and Grounds Cleaning and Maintenance Occupations are projected to boast the fifth-largest number of jobs among the groups; increasing by 27.3 percent 2020-2030; and to be the source of more than 45,700 annual average job openings. Installation, Maintenance and Repair Occupations and Transportation and Material Moving Occupations complete the list, each with projected increases in jobs above 24 percent 2020-2030 and more than 20,000 average annual job openings between them.

New York State Labor Department occupational projections show the SOCs most associated with the caregiving industry in New York had a total of 3,340,690 jobs statewide as of 2020. That number was projected to increase by 823,830 jobs or 24.7 percent by 2030, and with average annual job openings among those occupations of 481,191 jobs 2020-2030.

IV. Recent State Investments in New York's Caregiving Economy

Last year, Governor Kathy Hochul and the New York State Legislature initiated a significant, multi-year investment in New York's caregiving economy. Key components of this multi-year investment include:

- **Health Care Bonus Worker Program.** The FY2023 Enacted Budget establishes the Health Care and Mental Hygiene Worker Bonus program, which includes \$1.3 billion allocated for the payment of recruitment and retention bonuses to certain health care and mental hygiene workers. Bonuses of up to \$3,000 are to be available to full-time workers who remain in their positions for one year, and prorated bonuses for those working fewer hours. The program launched in August 2022 with an online portal that allows eligible employers to disburse funds to qualified employees.
- **Cost of Living Adjustments for Human Services Workers.** The FY2023 Enacted Budget includes \$500 million for adjustments to raise wages for human services workers, and a 5.4 percent cost of living adjustment for human services workers.
- **Increased Minimum Wage for Home Care Workers.** The FY2023 Enacted Budget includes \$7.7 billion over four years to increase the home care worker minimum wage by \$3.
- **Supporting the Mental Health Workforce.** In October 2021, Governor Hochul announced \$21 million in federal workforce recruitment and retention funds to strengthen the State's mental health workforce by providing recruitment and retention incentives, educational expenses, and career development and training. In November 2021, Governor Hochul announced \$4 million in federal workforce recruitment and retention funds that can be used for recruitment and retention incentives to support and expand the Certified and Credentialed Mental Health Peer Workforce.
- **Professionalizing the Direct Support Workforce.** In August 2022, Governor Hochul announced a \$10 million partnership between OPWDD and the National Alliance for Direct Support Professionals to expand opportunities for professional credentialing for nearly 2,500 direct support professionals in the developmental disabilities field throughout New York State and address worker shortages.
- **Nurses for Our Future Scholarships.** In August 2022, Governor Hochul announced nearly 1,000 new future nurses as part of the ongoing efforts to strengthen and bolster New York State's health care workforce through the "Nurses for Our Future" Scholarship Program – an initiative designed to

recruit and retrain nursing and healthcare professionals to serve as New York State Registered Nurses.

- **Funding for Workers Who Directly Support Those with Developmental Disabilities.** In November 2021, Governor Hochul announced that the New York Office for People with Developmental Disabilities will provide over \$1.5 billion in one-time American Rescue Plan Act Funding to support recruitment efforts, retention incentives and vaccination bonuses for direct support professionals who provide support for people with developmental disabilities in an effort to address workforce shortages in this field.
- **Investing in Child Care.** The FY 2023 Enacted Budget makes historic public investments to overhaul the child care system. This included a four-year, \$7 billion commitment to improving the Child Care Assistance Program (CCAP), expanding income eligibility to more than half of all young children in New York. The Budget also increased State reimbursement rates to providers to expand the number of programs from which families can choose and invested \$50 million to establish a child care capital program. To bolster and stabilize the industry, the Budget provided \$343 million to child care providers and to help support the child care workforce, including for wage increases, bonuses, tuition reimbursement, and contributions to staff retirement plans and health insurance costs. The Budget also invested \$15.6 million to expand child care at SUNY and CUNY campuses.

V. Addressing New York's Caregiving Future

For older New Yorkers, or those with disabilities or with young children needing care, the ability to thrive in their communities depends on access to a broad range of public and private programs, resources, and supports, including health care, home care, food and nutrition, human services, housing and transportation. New York's systems of care will need to be prepared to handle growth in demand and changing preferences for location and types of services, especially long-term care. Taxpayer dollars are a large and central source of support for services that are essential to quality of life for many New Yorkers. The expense for this care, in turn, comprises a significant share of the total cost New Yorkers pay for their government. It is imperative for the State to strategically and comprehensively plan and anticipate the needs for care, so New Yorkers of all ages can continue to live fulfilling lives, as independently as possible, in good health, and with the freedom to choose where they live. Essential needs must be prioritized in a meaningful way with broad, inclusive stakeholder engagement.

Last year, Governor Hochul directed the creation of the first-ever statewide Master Plan for Aging to ensure New Yorkers can age with dignity and independence wherever they choose. By Executive Order 23, Governor Hochul established a

New York State Master Plan for Aging that will coordinate existing and new state policy and programs by creating a blueprint of strategies to be implemented to ensure older New Yorkers and New Yorkers with disabilities can live fulfilling lives, in good health, with freedom, dignity and independence for as long as possible. DOH, in coordination with the State Office for the Aging, was charged with convening a Master Plan for Aging Council to advise the Governor in developing the New York State Master Plan for Aging, with DOH and SOFA serving as Chair and Vice-Chair of the Council, respectively. A new Office of Aging and Long-Term Care was created as part of a DOH restructuring to help drive this process. Members of the Council include the Commissioners and Directors of relevant Executive agencies, and all Executive branch agencies are directed to participate on and assist with the work of the Master Plan for Aging Council.

The work of the Council is aided by the Master Plan for Aging Stakeholder Advisory Committee, which is advising the Council in the development of the Master Plan. The Stakeholder Advisory Committee includes representatives from a broad array of health care and support service providers, consumers, informal caregivers, older adults and those with disabilities—particularly those in communities experiencing disparities: health plans, labor organizations, community-based organizations, employers, academic researchers, foundations, local governments, and tribal communities.

Pursuant to the Executive Order, the Council and Advisory Committee are expected to produce a preliminary report to the Governor by July 2023, and then a final report due July 2024. The work of the Council and Advisory Committee is underway at the time of writing, with various subcommittees engaged in-depth with a wide spectrum of topics that impact aging New Yorkers and those with disabling conditions requiring care, from long-term care services, to housing to economic security, the caregiver workforce, the development of innovative technologies, treatments and methodologies of care. The Council is expected to develop a set of policy proposals that can be implemented either through regulation or legislation at the state and local level to address the whole ecosystem of aging and long-term care in New York. This Master Plan process and the resulting analysis and recommendations are instrumental for New York's caregiving economy. ESD defers to the expertise engaged with that undertaking.

While the work of developing the Master Plan is underway, Governor Hochul and the New York State Legislature have enacted a budget for 2023-2024 that provides for a series of initiatives to build on progress made in aging and long-term care. These include:

- Permitting Area Agencies on Aging to serve more individuals by allowing individuals whose income is at or above 250 percent of the federal poverty level to pay for certain services, thereby generating revenue that must be

reinvested back into service provision, ultimately reducing waiting lists and meeting new and emerging needs.

- Investing \$2.5 million in additional funding, annually, for the Long-Term Care Ombudsman Program to help address complaints and advocate for improvements in the long-term care system more extensively across the state.
- Requiring healthcare facilities to notify an individual, upon discharge, of the possibility of placement into a Veterans Nursing Home, rather than a traditional nursing home, while providing \$500,000 (\$200,000 in FY24 and \$300,000 in FY25) for the development of a strategic and modernization plan for the five State Veterans' Homes. This plan will help the facilities recover from COVID-19 and aid in the creation of a sustainable operations model.

The Enacted Budget for 2023-2024 also provides for related investments that include:

- An increase in Medicaid rates of up to 7.5 percent for nursing homes and a 6.5 percent increase for outpatient hospital services and assisted living providers;
- Funding to provide a 4.0 percent Human Services Cost of Living Adjustment, including for applicable programs in OCFS and the State Office for the Aging.
- Authority for DOH to reform Managed Long Term Care (MLTC) by establishing MLTC performance standards on or before January 1, 2024 that require each plan to offer a Medicare integrated plan (D-SNP) with a quality star rating of three stars or greater, and require that these plans meet certain minimum quality metrics.
- Funding for \$9.2 million investment into the New York State Office for the Aging's Expanded In-home Services for the Elderly Program for community-based, non-medical supports for aging New Yorkers. The investment helps serve more older adults, will help them maintain their autonomy, and delay future Medicaid costs by intervening with less intensive services earlier.
- An investment of \$5.3 billion over five years to increase homecare workers' wages by 55 cents per year for three years and index the wage to inflation beginning in 2027. This will help improve access to home health and personal care services for over 300,000 elderly and disabled individuals enrolled in Medicaid.

The system of child care services and supports in New York State has similarly undergone profound change in recent years. Issues of the availability of quality, affordable child care led to creation of the New York State Child Care Availability Task Force, whose work and resulting recommendations helped catalyze a series of key investments and programmatic reforms designed to improve access to affordable, quality child care more extensively and equitably throughout the state.

The FY 2024 Budget builds on the historic investments enacted in FY 2023 with a bold plan to make New York's child care system fairer, more affordable, and easier to access. Increasing the state's commitment to child care assistance to an unprecedented \$7.6 billion over four years, New York under Governor Hochul's leadership will¹⁵:

- **Expand Access to Child Care.** After the FY 2023 Budget dramatically increased the number of families with access to child care assistance, the FY 2024 Budget expands eligibility further by raising the income limit to the maximum allowed by Federal law – which is 85 percent of New York's median income, or approximately \$93,200 per year for a family of four. As a result, the families of an estimated 113,000 more children will become newly eligible for child care assistance.
- **Streamline and Centralize the Child Care Application Process.** The Budget improves child care accessibility through a statewide electronic solution allowing families to pre-screen for eligibility and apply for child care assistance, removing redundant processes and unnecessary reporting requirements placed on families. In addition, the Budget eliminates a redundancy requiring families that participate in programs, such as the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program, the Home Energy Assistance Program, Medicaid, and the Special Supplemental Nutrition Program for Women, Infants, and Children to prove that they are income-eligible for the Child Care Assistance Program. As a result of these changes, an estimated 83,400 children in already-eligible families will have easier access to the Child Care Assistance Program.
- **Standardize Eligibility.** Local districts that administer child care assistance have significant flexibility to set their own eligibility criteria, which creates inconsistency in access across the State. To eliminate disparities and support greater access to care, the Budget standardizes the number of allowable absences at 80 for all districts, and caps co-payments at one percent of family income above the poverty level. Approximately half of the

¹⁵ For more see: <https://www.governor.ny.gov/news/governor-hochul-announces-significant-actions-expand-affordable-child-care-access-statewide>

districts already cap co-payments at one percent of family income, but in other districts, co-payments can be as high as ten percent of family income. By capping co-payments at one percent of family income, an estimated 10 percent of families in the Child Care Assistance Program will see a reduction in child care costs.

- **Encourage Space for Child Care.** Child care providers often struggle to afford high rent and compete for space in a market that is limited by strict but important safety rules. Building off an unprecedented investment of \$100 million to increase the capacity of programs in child care deserts, the State will take further action to ensure child care facilities are integrated into the fabric of our communities. Homes and Community Renewal will expressly favor applications for its Low-Income Housing Tax Credit that incorporate child care facility space.
- **Expand Tax Relief to Parents.** The FY 2024 Budget invests in New York's families by expanding the Empire State Child Credit (ESCC) to include children under four years of age. This expansion will provide \$179 million in total support for over 525,000 low and middle-income taxpayers thanks to the inclusion of nearly 630,000 additional children. The ESCC, which has excluded children under four since its inception in 2006, will now provide an additional average benefit of \$340 per affected taxpayer and \$284 per newly included child.
- **Support the Child Care Workforce.** Last year, New York invested in a second round of stabilization grants to child care providers, with at least 75 percent of those funds dedicated specifically to supporting the workforce. The FY2024 Budget invests \$500 million for a third round of stabilization grants for workforce retention initiatives. The Budget directs these unspent Federal funds to establish a new Workforce Retention Grant Program to provide payments to child care providers at 17,000 programs statewide. Grants will also be used to cover payroll tax assistance and support staff recruitment strategies and other expenses related to hiring new staff. The Budget also maintains last year's investment to support the increase in market rates to the 80th percentile – among the highest in the nation – which not only broadens child care options for families, but also dramatically increases payments to providers, by over 30 percent on average.
- **Create an Employer-Supported Child Care Pilot Program.** To better address affordability for families that are ineligible for CCAP, and to harness partnerships with employers looking to invest in their workforce, the Budget establishes the New York State Employer-Supported Child Care (ESCC) pilot program. In the ESCC pilot, employers will contribute a third of the cost of care for families between 85 percent and 100 percent of

the State median income, and the State will match it, reducing out-of-pocket costs for these families and generating millions of dollars in new financial support for child care. The Budget provides \$4.8 million to launch this pilot program, which will operate in three regions of the State, with local facilitators working to coordinate businesses, families, and child care providers.

- Incentivize Employer-Based Child Care Models. The preexisting Federal and State employer-provided child care credits have not been widely utilized by employers due to limitations on eligible expenses and other restrictions. The Budget invests \$25 million to create a more flexible statewide, two-year business income tax credit for businesses that create or expand child care access for their employees. The proposal aligns with a similar New York City business income tax credit, allowing for city-level and state-level outcomes to be evaluated at the same time.
- Create a Business Navigator Program. The Budget establishes a Business Navigator program in each of the 10 Regional Economic Development Council regions to help interested businesses identify options to support employees' child care needs.

Notably for the outlook ahead, New York State Child Care Task Force was extended and broadened this past year, by agreement between Governor Hochul, relevant Committee chairs and legislative sponsors in the New York State Assembly and Senate. In addition to expanding membership, the Task Force will focus on and provide an evaluation of the impact of COVID-19 on the child care sector; assess the implementation of policies supported by federally funded programs through various stimulus packages; recommend potential solutions to address chronic child care workforce issues; advise the State on how to implement recommendations to address issues that plague child care providers; and advise the State on how to implement a universal child care model. The continuing work of the Task Force and its implementation partners will be key ingredients in shaping New York's caregiving industries for the future.

Appendix A: Table 7: Employment Projections for Caregiving Occupations in New York State

SOC Code	Title	Employment		Change		Annual Average Openings	Annual Wages (\$) - 2022			Education Needed for Entry	Prior Work in Field
		2020	2030	Net	Percent		Mean	Entry	Experienced		
Healthcare Support Occupations											
31-1120	Home Health & Personal Care Aides	510,870	710,570	199,700	39.1%	93,648	\$36,750	\$30,490	\$38,380	HS or Equiv	None
31-1131	Nursing Assistants	90,150	105,510	15,360	17.0%	13,338	\$43,400	\$34,060	\$48,070	Postsec cert	None
31-2011	Occupational Therapy Assistants	2,850	4,040	1,190	41.8%	543	\$69,030	\$49,510	\$78,780	Associate's	None
31-2021	Physical Therapist Assistants	5,880	8,410	2,550	43.5%	1,100	\$64,330	\$48,020	\$72,480	Associate's	None
31-9092	Medical Assistants	28,160	35,820	7,660	27.2%	4,469	\$44,900	\$35,770	\$49,470	Postsec cert	None
31-9099	Healthcare Support Workers, All Other	5,100	6,020	920	18.0%	766	\$46,690	\$34,550	\$52,760	HS or Equiv	None
	Subtotal	642,990	870,370	227,380	35.4%	113,864					
Healthcare Professional and Technical Occupations											
29-1031	Dietitians & Nutritionists	5,050	6,100	1,050	20.8%	480	\$75,030	\$55,440	\$84,830	Bachelor's	None
29-1122	Occupational Therapists	11,460	14,300	2,840	24.8%	982	\$99,120	\$65,440	\$115,960	Master's	None
29-1123	Physical Therapists	18,510	23,650	5,140	27.8%	1,369	\$96,210	\$70,710	\$107,470	Profes deg	None
29-1125	Recreational Therapists	1,550	1,820	270	17.4%	153	\$61,640	\$44,740	\$70,090	Bachelor's	None
29-1126	Respiratory Therapists	6,710	8,780	2,070	30.8%	568	\$86,650	\$66,260	\$96,850	Associate's	None
29-1127	Speech-Language Pathologists	14,010	19,570	5,560	39.7%	1,549	\$102,400	\$66,720	\$120,240	Master's	None
29-1128	Exercise Physiologists	730	860	130	17.8%	65	\$68,960	\$49,970	\$78,450	Bachelor's	None
29-1129	Therapists, All Other	1,860	2,240	380	20.4%	171	\$73,540	\$44,820	\$87,900	Bachelor's	None
29-1141	Registered Nurses	197,160	230,580	33,420	17.0%	14,430	\$96,550	\$68,440	\$110,610	Bachelor's	None
29-2053	Psychiatric Technicians	2,770	3,340	570	20.6%	272	\$44,500	\$32,030	\$50,730	Postsec cert	<5 years
29-2061	Licensed Practical & Vocational Nurses	48,730	57,740	9,010	18.5%	4,918	\$56,410	\$45,040	\$62,100	Postsec cert	None
	Subtotal	308,540	368,980	60,440	19.6%	24,957					
Community and Social Service Occupations											
21-1021	Child, Family, & School Social Workers	27,830	34,560	6,730	24.2%	3,520	\$71,150	\$48,880	\$82,280	Bachelor's	None
21-1022	Healthcare Social Workers	20,020	25,360	5,340	26.7%	2,604	\$64,160	\$42,920	\$74,780	Master's	None
21-1023	Ment Hlth & Subst Abuse Social Workers	12,200	15,390	3,190	26.1%	1,578	\$77,410	\$48,500	\$91,860	Master's	None
21-1093	Social & Human Service Assistants	41,530	56,350	14,820	35.7%	7,126	\$44,060	\$32,160	\$50,010	HS or Equiv	None
21-1094	Community Health Workers	8,130	11,700	3,570	43.9%	1,377	\$52,790	\$36,140	\$61,120	HS or Equiv	None
21-1099	Community & SocServ Specists, All Other	14,030	16,480	2,450	17.5%	1,815	\$64,350	\$47,320	\$72,860	Bachelor's	None
	Subtotal	123,740	159,840	36,100	29.2%	18,020					
Office and Administrative Support Occupations											
43-1011	First-Line Supvr's Office & Admin Support	105,800	118,280	12,480	11.8%	12,253	\$80,940	\$62,670	\$95,070	HS or Equiv	<5 years
43-3021	Billing & Posting Clerks	33,540	37,900	4,360	13.0%	4,094	\$50,310	\$36,490	\$57,220	HS or Equiv	None
43-3031	Bookkeeping, Accounting, & Auditing Clerks	102,000	114,150	12,150	11.9%	13,067	\$52,790	\$36,110	\$61,130	Some college	None
43-3051	Payroll & Timekeeping Clerks	7,960	7,920	-40	-0.5%	807	\$56,800	\$41,060	\$64,680	HS or Equiv	None
43-4171	Receptionists & Information Clerks	92,830	111,860	19,030	20.5%	14,685	\$39,630	\$30,410	\$44,240	HS or Equiv	None
43-5061	Production, Planning, & Expediting Clerks	47,020	58,960	11,940	25.4%	6,528	\$57,640	\$40,050	\$66,440	HS or Equiv	None
43-6011	Exec Sec & Exec Admin Assistants	94,740	86,040	-8,700	-9.2%	8,776	\$82,810	\$59,040	\$94,700	HS or Equiv	<5 years

Appendix A: Table 7, cont.: Employment Projections for Caregiving Occupations in New York State

SOC Code	Title	Employment		Change		Annual Average Openings	Annual Wages (\$) - 2022			Education Needed for Entry	Prior Work in Field
		2020	2030	Net	Percent		Mean	Entry	Experienced		
Office and Administrative Support Occupations, cont											
43-6013	Medical Secretaries	10,760	12,680	1,920	17.8%	1,442	\$44,700	\$33,750	\$50,170	HS or Equiv	None
43-6014	Sec & Admin Assis, not Lgl, Med Exec	168,910	180,370	11,460	6.8%	19,784	\$46,590	\$34,490	\$52,630	HS or Equiv	None
43-9061	Office Clerks, General	181,740	197,610	15,870	8.7%	23,185	\$43,800	\$30,870	\$50,270	HS or Equiv	None
	Subtotal	847,320	927,800	80,480	9.5%	104,621					
Education, Training, and Library Occupations											
25-2011	Preschool Teachers, Except Spec Ed	24,220	33,630	9,410	38.9%	3,814	\$45,800	\$30,360	\$53,530	Associate's	None
25-3021	Self-Enrichment Education Teachers	35,420	54,450	19,030	53.7%	6,993	\$72,240	\$36,500	\$90,110	HS or Equiv	<5 years
25-9031	Instructional Coordinators	24,140	28,950	4,810	19.9%	2,949	\$91,580	\$48,870	\$97,930	Master's	>5 years
25-9045	Teaching Assistants, Except Postsecondry	121,020	144,050	23,030	19.0%	14,424	\$35,730	\$28,390	\$39,400	Some college	None
	Subtotal	204,800	261,080	56,280	27.5%	28,180					
Personal Care and Service Occupations											
39-1098	First-Line Sprvrs Persnl Serv Entr & Rec	17,200	25,820	8,620	50.1%	3,138	N/A	N/A	N/A	HS or Equiv	<5 years
39-9011	Childcare Workers	78,750	93,280	14,530	18.5%	13,251	\$35,310	\$29,640	\$38,150	HS or Equiv	None
39-9032	Recreation Workers	29,720	43,690	13,970	47.0%	7,032	\$41,440	\$30,220	\$47,050	HS or Equiv	None
39-9041	Residential Advisors	9,180	11,430	2,250	24.5%	1,669	\$43,160	\$32,900	\$48,290	HS or Equiv	None
	Subtotal	134,850	174,220	39,370	29.2%	25,090					
Management Occupations											
11-1021	General & Operations Managers	161,620	210,190	48,570	30.1%	20,096	\$150,720	\$64,700	\$193,730	Bachelor's	>5 years
11-9031	Ed Admins, Preski & Childcare Ctr	3,440	4,340	900	26.2%	367	\$69,760	\$41,890	\$83,700	Bachelor's	<5 years
11-9039	Education Administrators, All Other	2,200	2,850	650	29.5%	245	\$115,510	\$61,990	\$142,270	Bachelor's	<5 years
11-9111	Medical & Health Services Managers	27,630	39,270	11,640	42.1%	3,699	\$159,710	\$95,680	\$191,720	Bachelor's	<5 years
11-9151	Social & Community Service Managers	15,320	19,950	4,630	30.2%	1,938	\$92,760	\$62,360	\$107,970	Bachelor's	<5 years
	Subtotal	210,210	276,600	66,390	31.6%	26,345					
Food Preparation and Serving Related Occupations											
35-1012	First-Line Supervisors Food Prep & Serv Wkrs	36,030	67,470	31,440	87.3%	10,727	\$50,990	\$34,720	\$69,120	HS or Equiv	<5 years
35-2012	Cooks, Institution & Cafeteria	15,340	19,750	4,410	28.7%	2,975	\$43,730	\$32,480	\$49,350	No formal req	None
35-2021	Food Preparation Workers	45,990	70,370	24,380	53.0%	12,358	\$36,820	\$30,400	\$40,020	No formal req	None
35-3041	Food Servers, Nonrestaurant	15,920	20,400	4,480	28.1%	3,303	\$39,000	\$30,130	\$43,430	No formal req	None
35-9021	Dishwashers	22,100	42,310	20,210	91.4%	7,136	\$35,450	\$29,460	\$38,440	No formal req	None
35-9099	Food Prep & Serv Wkrs, All Other	2,210	3,240	1,030	46.6%	574	\$36,490	\$28,830	\$40,320	No formal req	None
	Subtotal	137,590	223,540	85,950	62.5%	37,073					

Appendix A: Table 7, cont.: Employment Projections for Caregiving Occupations in New York State

SOC Code	Title	Employment		Change		Annual Average Openings	Annual Wages (\$) - 2022			Education Needed for Entry	Prior Work in Field
		2020	2030	Net	Percent		Mean	Entry	Experienced		
Business and Financial Operations; Computer Occupations											
13-1041	Compliance Officers	24,110	28,380	4,270	17.7%	2,457	\$88,140	\$54,040	\$105,200	Bachelor's	None
13-1051	Cost Estimators	8,870	10,600	1,730	19.5%	1,035	\$87,740	\$50,450	\$106,390	Bachelor's	None
13-1071	Human Resources Specialists	41,330	51,460	10,130	24.5%	5,353	\$87,400	\$50,840	\$105,690	Bachelor's	None
13-2011	Accountants & Auditors	121,960	142,070	20,110	16.5%	13,511	\$108,020	\$62,660	\$130,700	Bachelor's	None
15-1232	Computer User Support Specialists	45,890	54,240	8,350	18.2%	4,424	\$67,470	\$42,430	\$79,990	Some college	None
19-0000	Life, Physical, & Social Science	79,580	93,480	13,900	17.5%	9,238	\$90,180	\$50,410	\$110,070		
	Subtotal	321,740	380,230	58,490	18.2%	36,018					
Building and Grounds Cleaning and Maintenance											
37-1011	First-Line Supervisors Housekeeping & Janitorial	14,490	17,870	3,380	23.3%	2,151	\$57,730	\$37,900	\$67,650	HS or Equiv	<5 years
37-2011	Janitors & Cleaners, not Maids & Housekeeping	179,080	225,420	46,340	25.9%	31,432	\$41,230	\$30,590	\$46,550	No formal req	None
37-2012	Maids & Housekeeping Cleaners	65,510	86,510	21,000	32.1%	12,153	\$42,110	\$30,580	\$47,880	No formal req	None
	Subtotal	259,080	329,800	70,720	27.3%	45,736					
Installation, Maintenance, and Repair Occupations											
49-9071	Maintenance & Repair Workers, General	120,430	149,670	29,240	24.3%	15,561	\$52,520	\$34,640	\$61,460	HS or Equiv	None
51-6011	Laundry & Dry-Cleaning Workers	12,820	21,810	8,990	70.1%	3,181	\$33,220	\$29,060	\$35,290	No formal req	None
	Subtotal	133,250	171,480	38,230	28.7%	18,742					
Transportation and Material Moving Occupations											
53-3011	Ambulance Drivers/Attendants, not EMTs	460	620	160	34.8%	76	\$36,720	\$29,770	\$40,200	HS or Equiv	None
53-3052	Bus Drivers/Shuttle Drivers	16,120	19,960	3,840	23.8%	2,469	\$74,400	\$55,580	\$83,820	HS or Equiv	None
	Subtotal	16,580	20,580	4,000	24.1%	2,545					
	"Caregiving Industry" Total	3,340,690	4,164,520	823,830	24.7%	481,191					

Source: New York State Department of Labor. Long-Term Occupational Projections for New York State 2020-2030. Data are from Occupational Employment and Wage Statistics series, updated every other year for a 10-year projection. Change from base year is estimated to a projection year, with expected total and annual average openings; average, entry- and experienced-level wages; educational requirements and requirements for prior years of experience in the occupation. Occupations are according to Standard Occupational Codes, identified as most associated with industry groups corresponding to "Caregiving Industries" in New York State, per Staffing Patterns for NAICS 6216: Home Health Care Services, 6216: Home Health Care Services, 6223: Other Hospitals, 6231: Nursing Care Facilities, 6232: Residential Mental Health Facilities, 6233: Community Care Facility for the Elderly, 6239: Other Residential Care Facilities, 6241: Individual and Family Services, and 6244: Child Day Care Services.

Appendix B: New York State Tech Sector

Six-Digit NAICS Code	Description
333242	Semiconductor Machinery Manufacturing
334111	Electronic Computer Manufacturing
334112	Computer Storage Device Manufacturing
334118	Computer Terminal and Other Computer Peripheral Equipment Manufacturing
334210	Telephone Apparatus Manufacturing
334220	Radio and Television Broadcasting and Wireless Communications Equipment Manufacturing
334290	Other Communications Equipment Manufacturing
334310	Audio and Video Equipment Manufacturing
334412	Bare Printed Circuit Board Manufacturing
334413	Semiconductor and Related Device Manufacturing
334416	Capacitor, Resistor, Coil, Transformer, and Other Inductor Manufacturing
334417	Electronic Connector Manufacturing
334418	Printed Circuit Assembly (Electronic Assembly) Manufacturing
334419	Other Electronic Component Manufacturing
334510	Electromedical and Electrotherapeutic Apparatus Manufacturing
334511	Search, Detection, Navigation, Guidance, Aeronautical, and Nautical System and Instrument Manufacturing
334512	Automatic Environmental Control Manufacturing for Residential, Commercial, and Appliance Use
334513	Instruments and Related Products Manufacturing for Measuring, Displaying, and Controlling Industrial Process Variables
334514	Totalizing Fluid Meter and Counting Device Manufacturing
334515	Instrument Manufacturing for Measuring and Testing Electricity and Electrical Signals
334516	Analytical Laboratory Instrument Manufacturing
334517	Irradiation Apparatus Manufacturing
334519	Other Measuring and Controlling Device Manufacturing
334613	Blank Magnetic and Optical Recording Media Manufacturing
334614	Software and Other Prerecorded Compact Disc, Tape, and Record Reproducing
423430	Computer and Computer Peripheral Equipment and Software Merchant Wholesalers
511210	Software Publishers
517311	Wired Telecommunications Carriers
517312	Wireless Telecommunications Carriers (except Satellite)
517410	Satellite Telecommunications
517911	Telecommunications Resellers
517919	All Other Telecommunications
518210	Data Processing, Hosting, and Related Services
519130	Internet Publishing and Broadcasting and Web Search Portals
541511	Custom Computer Programming Services
541512	Computer Systems Design Services
541513	Computer Facilities Management Services
541519	Other Computer Related Services
611420	Computer Training
811211	Consumer Electronics Repair and Maintenance
811212	Computer and Office Machine Repair and Maintenance
811213	Communication Equipment Repair and Maintenance
811219	Other Electronic and Precision Equipment Repair and Maintenance

Source: Empire State Development