



New York State  
Department of Economic Development  
Division of Minority and Women's  
Business Development

---

In the matter of the appeal of

**Laura Li Industries, LLC**

FINAL ORDER 24-01

From a denial of certification as a Woman-owned Business Enterprise pursuant to Executive Law Article 15-A.

---

This order arises from an administrative appeal brought on behalf of Laura Li Industries, LLC (“Laura Li” or “Appellant”) pursuant to section 144.2 of Title 5 of the New York Codes, Rules and Regulations. Appellant seeks reversal of the decision of the Division of Minority and Women’s Business Development (the “Division”), dated April 12, 2023, to deny Laura Li’s December 1, 2022, application for certification as a Woman-owned Business Enterprise (“WBE”).

Appellant filed a request to appeal via written submission to the Division, dated April 21, 2023. A notice to proceed via written appeal was sent to Laura Li on May 4, 2023. Appellant submitted its written appeal dated May 10, 2023. In response to the Appellant’s appeal request, the affidavit of Glenn Butler, Associate Certification Director, dated August 30, 2023, was filed along with a response brief written by Counsel for the Division, Diedre Chuckrow Esq., dated September 18, 2023. Administrative Law Judge (“ALJ”) David A. Murad presided over the appeal.

The issues on appeal were whether Appellant sufficiently demonstrated that the Woman owner relied upon for certification (1) has demonstrated having made a capital contribution to the business enterprise proportionate to their equity interest therein, as demonstrated by, but not limited to, contributions of money, property, equipment, or expertise, as required under 5 NYCRR § 144.2(b)(2); (2) shares in the risks and profits of the business enterprise in proportion to their equity interests therein, as required under 5 NYCRR §144.2(b)(3); (3) possesses adequate, industry-specific competence to make critical business decisions without relying upon other persons, as required under 5 NYCRR §144.2(c)(1); (d) makes operational decisions on a day-to-day basis with respect to the critical functions of the business enterprise, as required under 5 NYCRR §144.2(c)(2); (e) devotes time on an ongoing basis to the daily operation of the

business enterprise, as required under 5 NYCRR §144.2(c)(3); and (f) whether the business enterprise operates independently, as required under 5 NYCRR § 144.2(e).

On December 20, 2023, the Division received a Recommended Order from ALJ Murad that recommended affirmation of the Division's denial of the application to certify of Laura Li Industries, LLC as an MBE on the grounds set forth in the Division's April 12, 2023, denial letter.

After considering the appeal record, I accept the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge as it pertains to the facts of this case. Incorporation by reference is hereby made with respect to the findings and conclusions of the Recommended Order.

It is hereby **ORDERED** that the decision to deny certification, dated April 12, 2023, is affirmed. Accordingly, Laura Li Industries, LLC will not be listed in the Division's directory for Minority and Women-owned Business Enterprises.

February 7, 2024



---

Jason M. Clark  
Executive Vice President and Executive Director  
Division of Minority and Women's Business Development