



REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS (RFP)
Columbia University Compliance Monitoring Services

RFP Release Date: February 22, 2021

Q&A Response Date: March 12, 2021

The following is a list of responses to questions submitted by prospective respondents to the ESD Request for Proposals for Columbia University Compliance Monitoring Services. A copy of the RFP is available at: https://esd.ny.gov/doing-business-ny/requests-proposals/columbia-university-compliance-monitoring-services-%E2%80%93-request

Columbia University Compliance Monitoring Services RFP - Responses to Questions

Table with 3 columns: No., Question, Answer. Contains 4 rows of Q&A pairs regarding construction value, timeline, GPP obligations, and site access.

No.	Question	Answer
5	<p>In Section II “Overview”, the RFP refers to the five structures that the Project consist of, including the completed three buildings: “Mind Brain Behavior” science center at 129th and Broadway, the “Lenfest Center for the Arts” and the “University Forum Building”.</p> <p>a) Will the awarded Bidder for this contract be required to review compliance documents for the three completed buildings, in addition to the Business School’s two new facilities?</p> <p>b) Similarly, Section 2.07 of the Restrictive Declaration and Section II of the RFP (“Overview”) reflects that construction is underway for the “Ronald O. Perelman Center for Business Innovation” and the “Henry R. Kravis Building”. Have compliance reviews already been conducted for this completed work or will it be the responsibility of the awarded Bidder? If any compliance reviews will have been conducted prior to the award of the new GPP Monitor, will the awarded Bidder have access to any compliance review documents, reports, etc. for future reference?</p> <p>c) Will NYS ESD expect the awarded GPP Monitor be to review documentation, records, etc. for any Columbia projects aside from the 5 buildings reflected within the RFP?</p>	<p>GPP Monitor is expected to review documents and records that will demonstrate Columbia’s level of compliance with the relevant sections of the Restrictive Declaration.</p> <p>The selected Respondent will be required to review recently reported and ongoing project activity and will have access to reference relevant historical documents relating to the project including reports and documentation submitted by its predecessors.</p>
6	<p>In Section “ii. Administrative Proposal”, the link to the State Finance Law 139j and 139k forms is not active. The link under “IX. Contractual Requirements” for the same forms is also not active. Please, update the proposal to include.</p>	<p>The required document may be found under Corporate Information on our website at www.esd.ny.gov. A direct link to the form may be accessed here</p>

No.	Question	Answer
7	In Section “vi. Non-Discrimination and Contractor & Supplier Diversity Requirements” of the “IX. Contractual Requirements”, the RFP states that an M/WBE Utilization Plan is required as part of the Bidder’s proposal submission. If the Bidder is a certified M/WBE, is an M/WBE Utilization Plan still required for submission with the proposal?	Yes. An MWBE and SDVOB Utilization Plan is required for all respondents. If you are a New York State-certified MWBE or SDVOB, you may count that certification towards the goals. MBE participation, WBE participation and SDVOB participation may not be substituted for each other.
8	In prior procurements of this RFP, Task 3: Tracking Construction Milestones and Delays was specifically detailed and included. Reviewing the current RFP that specific task doesn’t seem to be detailed. Is this task still a major part of the RFP scope?	The Scope of Work outlined in the RFP contains the work the selected Respondent will be expected to perform.
9	What tools and/or software does the project currently use as it relates to construction management as well as tracking and receiving contractor pay applications and tracking the construction schedule?	The project management software Columbia uses is called Primavera UNIFIER. Spend and other quantitative data is generally provided in a tabular format on paper, by pdf or MS Excel.
10	How often would ESD like a project manager to review and report on the construction time schedule for the project?	The GPP Monitor will be expected to schedule regular meetings with ESD to report progress as often as once per week and at least once monthly after a schedule of activities is agreed upon. The GPP Monitor’s oversight of the construction schedule is limited to the milestones in the relevant sections of Restrictive Declaration (Appendix 2) and MWL contracting and workforce goals.
11	What high-level criteria/components are assessed for the community benefit obligations of the GPP Obligations?	Each Obligation requires unique metrics to determine compliance. The monitor will be required to review and assess the Evidence of Compliance and make recommendations for additional Evidence of Compliance, if deemed necessary to determine compliance.
12	Is there a schedule of projects that will be executed within the contracted year?	Completion of the business school buildings (sites 6B & 7) and the open space between them is expected to be completed during the first quarter of 2022. Additional construction has not yet been announced.

No.	Question	Answer
13	Will the GPP be directly involved communicating with onsite entities (e.g. contractors, sub-contractors)?	All requests for additional information including meetings with Columbia’s contractors or consultants must be made or approved by ESD. A representative of Columbia must be present during any meetings with its contractors or consultants.
14	In RFPs previously issued for this work, there was an information session that was scheduled to walk-through the RFP, is there one this year?	An information session has not been scheduled.
15	What construction work is scheduled to be completed during the term of the newly selected GPP Monitor?	Completion of the business school buildings (sites 6B &7) and open space between them is expected to be completed during the first quarter of 2022.
16	Is the incumbent monitor eligible to be re-selected? Is there a cap on the number of years a GPP Monitor may serve?	The current GPP Monitor is eligible to submit a proposal. There is no cap on the number of years a GPP Monitor may serve.
17	Are there any ongoing tenant relocations? Are any expected within the term of the newly selected GPP Monitor?	No.
18	Have any areas of the GPP Monitor’s responsibility not yet been triggered due to significant delays in construction?	No.
19	Have any areas of the GPP Monitor’s responsibility been adjusted due to impacts related to COVID-19?	The responsibilities of the GPP Monitor remain the same however adjustments have been made to the information gathering process related to COVID-19 safety.

No.	Question	Answer
20	Section F Statement Concerning Conflicts of Interest item #2 refers to the respondent not providing services to Columbia within the past 5 years. Our firm had previously provided construction audit services directly for Columbia’s internal audit division on a couple of their building projects. This work was completed over two years ago. Would this prior work preclude our responding to this RFP?	We are posting an amendment to the RFP that updates the conflicts of interest provisions. The amendment requests disclosure of providing services to Columbia within the past five years and the nature of the services but no longer deems such services to be an absolute bar to engagement as the monitor. ESD will evaluate the information provided in determining whether a Respondent can independently evaluate Columbia’s compliance with the GPP obligations.
21	Where can we access the most recent version of the GPP and/or obtain a listing of the associated requirements?	The Modified General Project Plan (GPP) may be accessed here: www.esd.ny.gov The requirements for this compliance monitoring services role may be found in The Restrictive Declaration (Appendix 2).
22	How often is Evidence of Compliance documentation submitted by Columbia?	Columbia submits Evidence of Compliance as attachments to its Implementation Plan Report (IPR) annually. Workforce and contracting reports are submitted quarterly.
23	Understanding the number may vary by reporting period, what is the typical range of number of pages for an Evidence of Compliance submission?	You may review the most recent submission to ESD on Columbia's Neighbors website: https://neighbors.columbia.edu/content/2020-manchattanville-west-harlem-implementation-plan-report
24	What is the anticipated construction volume in terms of dollar value for the 12-month monitoring period referenced in this RFP?	Completion of the business school buildings (sites 6B & 7) and open space between them is expected to be completed during the first quarter of 2022. ESD does not impose budget or spending guidelines for the Project’s construction. Spend data is provided quarterly by Columbia in arrears.
25	The Office of General Services link regarding the Iran Divestment Act referenced in the RFP does not appear to be active. Can you please provide an updated link? (RFP Page 18, Section IX.iv)	The required document may be found under Corporate Information on our website at www.esd.ny.gov . A direct link to the form may be accessed here

No.	Question	Answer
26	Is the 6% SDVOB participation goal in addition to the 30% MWBE goal, for a total MWBE + SDVOB participation goal of 36%? (Pg 22, IX.vi)	That is correct. The current goals on the RFP are 15% MBE, 15% WBE and 6% SDVOB.
27	How many of the GPP Obligations, in total, will require monitorship during the first year of the monitorship? Can you provide a list of those Obligations? [RFP Reference – Article V, GPP Obligations, Page 48, Appendix 2]	The selected Respondent should be prepared to review any and all relevant Obligations outlined in Sections 2.10, 5.05, 5.06 and 5.07 (except 5.07(e)). The GPP Monitor will be expected to review and assess Evidence of Compliance submitted by Columbia through its Implementation Plan Report (IPR). You may review the most recent submission to ESD on Columbia's Neighbors website: https://neighbors.columbia.edu/content/2020-manhattanville-west-harlem-implementation-plan-report
28	What specific construction projects will be on-going in the first year of the monitorship, and what is the estimated dollar value of construction that will occur in the period? [RFP Reference – Article V, GPP Obligations, Page 48, Appendix 2]	Completion of the business school buildings (sites 6B & 7) and open space between them is expected to be completed during the first quarter of 2022. ESD does not impose budget guidelines for the Project's construction. Spend data is provided quarterly by Columbia in arrears.
29	Does ESD utilize an electronic platform to track the GPP Obligations that could be utilized by the monitor? If so, what is that platform? [RFP Reference – Article V, GPP Obligations, Page 48, Appendix 2]	There is no specific electronic platform used by ESD to track the status of the GPP Obligations.
30	Do you anticipate any tenant relocations on the Manhattanville project during the first year of the monitorship? If so, how many? [RFP Reference – Article V, GPP Obligations - Page 49, Appendix 2]	No.

No.	Question	Answer
31	<p>Since some of the projects are completed, is there any expectation that the monitor will be required to conduct look-back inquiries or oversight into Obligations associated with those projects in the first year of the monitorship? [RFP Reference – ARFP, page 3; Article V, GPP Obligations, Page 48, Appendix 2]</p>	<p>The selected Respondent will have access to and will be expected to review and reference work that has already been completed and continue any in-process review begun by the previous GPP Monitor.</p>
32	<p>Regarding Section III. A. (page 4) - How many implementation plans should the GPP Monitor be expected to review in Year 1?</p>	<p>One.</p>
33	<p>Regarding Section II (page 3) - Is there an updated construction schedule that can be provided to understand how many areas of the site will be active throughout Year 1?</p>	<p>Completion of the business school buildings (sites 6B & 7) and open space between them is expected to be completed during the first quarter of 2022. Additional construction has not yet been announced.</p>
34	<p>Regarding Section II (page 3) - Will the GPP monitor be involved in the compliance of the FEIS Requirements outlined in Article 3 of Appendix 2 or are the GPP obligations limited to the scope of work discussed in the sections listed in the following statement copied from the RFP: These obligations of Columbia, detailed in Sections 2.07, 2.10, 5.03, 5.05, 5.06 and 5.07 (other than obligations under Section 5.07(e)) of the Restrictive Declaration are collectively referred to in this RFP as the “GPP Obligations”.</p>	<p>The selected Respondent will not be responsible for FEIS Requirements outlined in Article 3 of the Restrictive Declaration.</p>

No.	Question	Answer
35	<p>In regards to the below language from the RFP, are the services provided to Columbia that would preclude a respondent from the work specific to a certain service (audit, tax, etc.), or total value, or would any and all work performed for Columbia within the past 5 years preclude the respondent from selection?</p> <p>Section F. Statement Concerning Conflicts of Interest</p> <p>A statement that Respondent has not provided services to Columbia within the past 5 years; that Respondent, if selected to serve as GPP Monitor, shall not serve as FEIS Monitor nor provide services to Columbia during the time it is engaged with ESD, nor shall any MBE/WBE/SDVOB partner, or any subconsultant engaged by Respondent, seek such work or negotiate to perform any such work for Columbia during such period; that Respondent, if selected to serve as GPP Monitor, shall not work for Columbia in any capacity within two years after the engagement as GPP Monitor has ended and shall be permanently barred from performing services for Columbia concerning any matter for which it was directly involved as GPP Monitor.</p>	<p>We are posting an amendment to the RFP that updates the conflicts of interest provisions. The amendment requests disclosure of providing services to Columbia within the past five years and the nature of the services but no longer deems such services to be an absolute bar to engagement as the monitor. ESD will evaluate the information provided in determining whether a Respondent can independently evaluate Columbia’s compliance with the GPP obligations.</p>